Bioethics and Real Life Application of Responsible Conduct of Research Principles: A Reflection and Attunement Dialogue

Stephen Olufemi Sodeke, PhD, MA
Bioethicist & Professor of Allied Health Sciences
Tuskegee University National Center for Bioethics in Research and Health Care, Tuskegee, AL

UAB Center for Clinical and Translational Science Training Academy; Thursday, November 21, 2013
Recognitions

Dr. David Chaplin
Dr. Peter Smith
Dr. Tom Huddle
Dr. Jeffrey Engler
Ms. Audrey Wrenn
Ms. Ann Smith
Acknowledgement and Disclaimer

This work was made possible (in part) through the U54CA118623 from the National Cancer Institute. The work of the National Center for Bioethics in Research and Health Care is supported (in part) by funding from the National Institute of Health through a Cooperative Agreement with the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC). The views expressed here do not necessarily reflect the official policies of the Department of Health and Human Services; nor does any mention of any organization imply the endorsement of the U.S. Government.
Expected Learning Outcomes

Attendees of the session can expect to:

- Gain a robust understanding of bioethics,
- Hone-in their ability to identify bioethical issues,
- Enhance their skills in applying “responsible conduct of research” principles to decision-making about issues of concern, and
- Develop appropriate attitudes for proposing and defending option(s) to resolve issues.
Reflection on Bioethics
Bioethics: Broadly Defined

Etymologically

Bioethics

Philosophically

Operationally
Tuskegee Integrative Bioethics (TIB)

Fragile Life-worlds

Systems

Scientific
Technical

Religious
Philosophical
Political
Legal

Social
Cultural
Economic

Systems

Systems

Systems
The Nature and Role of Bioethics

- Query actions
- Encourage scrutiny
- Alert us about moral sensibilities and chasms
- Proactively inculcate “bioethical maturity”
Bioethics: In Practice

Using a collection of ethical theories and principles, teaching and learning Bioethics include:

- Partly logical analysis
- Partly leaps of imagination
- Partly story telling and narratives threading
- Partly reflecting
- Partly remembering
- Partly deliberating
- Partly deciding

--- Tong, 2002
Some Examples of Concerns and Problems of Bioethics (1)

- The health and well-being of all people
- Enrollment in research
- Coercion of research participants
- Exploitation of research participants
- Manipulation of research participants
- Disproportionate representation
Some Examples of Concerns and Problems of Bioethics (2)

- Inappropriate use of research study design and data
- Misuse of power where power differentials exist
- Genetically-modified foods, food security, and human health
- Food safety, labeling, and priority-setting for funding
- Deforestation
- Impact of artificial food flavoring on health
- Integrity in research
Recommended Subject Matter for RCR Education (1)

- The scientist as a responsible member of society
- The environmental and societal impacts of scientific research
- Safe laboratory practices
- Policies regarding human subjects, live vertebrate animal subjects in research
- Data acquisition and laboratory tools; management, sharing and ownership
- Mentor/mentee responsibilities and relationships

---- (NIH/ORI NOT-OD-10-019)
Recommended Subject Matter for RCR Education (2)

- Peer review of manuscript for publication
- Responsible authorship and publication
- Collaborative research including collaborations with industry
- Conflicts of conscience, effort, and interest – personal, professional and financial
- Research misconduct and policies for handling misconduct
- Contemporary ethical issues in biomedical research

- ............IS ANYTHING MISSING? (PRRD)

----- (NIH/ORI NOT-OD-10-019)
Do You Agree or Disagree? Why?

- “Misconduct is not a problem in science because it does not occur often”
- “Only a crazy person would think they can get away with fraud, plagiarism, and other forms of misconduct”
- “No significant ethical issues arise in science because science is objective”
- “Science is about facts, ethics is about values and produces subjective opinions and disagreements, so scientists do not need to concern themselves about ethics”
- “Scientists do not need to engage in a philosophical or ethical discussion in order to know that they should not fabricate or falsify data”

Standards of Ethical Conduct in Science (Resnik, Chapter 4)

- Honesty
- Humility
- Carefulness
- Openness
- Freedom
- Credit
- Educate

- Social Responsibility
- Legality
- Opportunity
- Mutual Respect
- Efficiency
- Respect for Subjects
- Respect for community

------ Bulger et al, 2002; p. 58-61
Attunement on RCR Principles
Responsibilities for Integrity in Research

- Individual level
- Institutional level
- System level

Deciding Moment: “A Fork in The Road”

NEW YORK TIMES BESTSELLER

When You Come to a Fork in the Road

TAKE IT

Look Inside

Inspiration and Wisdom from One of Baseball’s Greatest Heroes

YOGI BERRA

Celebrated Memoir with DAVE KAPLAN
Bioethical Analysis Framework: One Approach to Making Decision

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FOTC</th>
<th>POSH</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>What are the Facts Of The Case?</td>
<td>What is the Preference Of StakeHolders?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WBTD</td>
<td>WHDN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What is the Best Thing To Do?</td>
<td>What Happens if we Do Nothing?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Justifying Best Action: Key Bioethical Questions (1)

- Does this action respect the sanctity of life?
- Is this action edifying or uplifting for the target of the action?
- Would the most ethical person I know take this action?
- How would I feel if this action were done to me?
- Would I do the action to those closest to me (brother, sister, mother, father, uncle, aunt)?
Justifying Best Action: Key Bioethical Questions (2)

- Does this action match my words to those who know me well?
- Is this action consistent with what I believe to be good?
- Will I feel guilty as a result of taking this action?
- What conflict(s) am I prepared to confront?
- Is this action at odds with or in compliance with rules and regulations? Is the action legal?
Discussion Questions

1. What is particularly troubling to you about this case? Who is harmed? What is betrayed?
2. What bioethical issues loom large in the case?
3. What lessons can we learn from this case at an individual level, institutional level, societal level?
4. Do you have any sympathy for the Physician-Scientist(s) or “persons of interest” featured in this case? Why? Why not? Did Dr. Potti act alone?
5. Can this happen again? Should it?
6. What are you prepared to do, and how would you do it to make a morally acceptable difference?
“Deception at Duke”

http://www.cbsnews.com/video/watch/?id=7398476n&tag=contentBody;storyMediaBox

60 Minutes Video-Clip; February, 2012
Discussion Questions

1. What is particularly troubling to you about this case? Who is harmed? What is betrayed?
2. What bioethical issues loom large in the case?
3. What lessons can we learn from this case at an individual level, institutional level, societal level?
4. Do you have any sympathy for the Physician-Scientist(s) or “persons of interest” featured in this case? Why? Why not? Did Dr. Potti act alone?
5. Can this happen again? Should it?
6. What are you prepared to do, and how would you do it to make a morally acceptable difference?
Parting Words: Reflection and Attunement

Oil on Canvas, 1920
Reee-member!!

Each one of us is a “piece” of the Jigsaw Puzzle when identifying and resolving bioethical issues for the benefit of all of us.

Take your “piece” with you to remind you!

> sodeke@mytu.tuskegee.edu
Helpful Resources (1 of 3)


Helpful Resources (3 of 3)


15. General Resources. DHHS, Office of Research Integrity, Last Updated 08/22/2011. [http://ori.dhhs.gov/general-resources-0](http://ori.dhhs.gov/general-resources-0).