

THE  
VULCAN HISTORICAL REVIEW



Vol. 18 • 2014

THE VULCAN HISTORICAL REVIEW  
VOLUME 18  
2014  
CHI OMICRON CHAPTER  
PHI ALPHA THETA HISTORY HONOR SOCIETY  
UNIVERSITY OF ALABAMA AT BIRMINGHAM



*The Vulcan Historical Review*  
**Volume 18**  
**2014**

---

**2014 Editorial Staff**

*Executive Editors*

Ashley Vee Foster

Jennifer E. Stitt

Nicole Watkins

*Graphic Designer*

Brandon Wicks

*Editorial Board*

Beth Chacon

Melissa Gilmore

Timothy R. Granger

Nicholas C. Hosford

Rachel Morgan

*Faculty Advisor*

Dr. Walter Ward

**Co-Sponsors**

The Linney Family Endowment for *The Vulcan Historical Review*

Dr. Linda Lucas, Provost, UAB

Dr. Suzanne Austin, Vice Provost for Student and Faculty Success, UAB

Dr. Bryan Noe, Dean of the Graduate School, UAB

Dr. Robert Palazzo, Dean of the College of Arts and Sciences, UAB

The Department of History, UAB

*The Vulcan Historical Review* is published annually by the Chi Omicron Chapter (UAB) of Phi Alpha Theta National History Honor Society. The journal is completely student-edited by undergraduate and graduate students at the University of Alabama at Birmingham. Our work is supported by donations from the UAB community and beyond. If you would like to help to cover the cost of future editions and to ensure the longevity of our journal, please use the QR code below or go to [www.paypal.com](http://www.paypal.com) to send your contribution to [phialphatheta@gmail.com](mailto:phialphatheta@gmail.com). Any amount is greatly appreciated.

©2014 Chi Omicron Chapter of Phi Alpha Theta National History Honor Society, the University of Alabama at Birmingham. All rights reserved. No material may be duplicated or quoted without the express written permission of the author. The University of Alabama at Birmingham, its departments, and its organizations disclaim any responsibility for statements, either in fact or opinion, made by contributors herein.

Cover art, “Antietam, Maryland. A lone grave,” circa 1862, courtesy of The Library of Congress.

All students at the University of Alabama at Birmingham, including recent alumni, are encouraged to submit research articles, book reviews, film reviews, essays, oral histories, historical fictions, or other works of historical interest to be considered for publication. Submissions by any currently-enrolled history undergraduate or graduate student from other institutions are also welcome. Please send inquiries to:

Phi Alpha Theta Advisor  
History Department HHB 360  
University of Alabama at Birmingham  
1401 University Boulevard  
Birmingham, Alabama 35294



---

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

---

**LETTER FROM THE EDITORS** ..... 8

## FEATURED INTERVIEW

*A Conversation with Eric Foner.*

Interviewed by Brian Steele, Ph.D., University of Alabama at Birmingham ..... 10

## ESSAYS

### **THE AMERICAN CIVIL WAR AND HUMAN RIGHTS**

*“Uncertainties, Mysteries, Doubts”: Unraveling Abraham Lincoln’s Perplexing Paradoxes*

by Jennifer E. Stitt, University of Alabama at Birmingham ..... 18

*Shiloh Baptist Church Tragedy: Tracing Theories of Collective Behavior to Understand Crowd Panic and How It Relates to the Birmingham Panic of 1902*

by Melissa Gilmore, University of Alabama at Birmingham ..... 32

*Unknown Civil Rights Heroes: Reverend T. Y. Rogers and Bloody Tuesday*

by Caleb McKerley, University of Alabama at Birmingham ..... 41

### **BRITISH AND EUROPEAN POLITICAL DISSIDENCE FROM THE MIDDLE AGES TO THE TWENTIETH CENTURY**

*Pretenders and Punishments*

by Rachel Morgan, University of Alabama at Birmingham ..... 54

|  |    |
|--|----|
| <i>When Reasonable People Are Alarmed: Riots, Rioters, and the Press in Eighteenth-century England</i> |    |
| by Nicole Watkins, University of Alabama at Birmingham .....   | 68 |
| <i>The Loss of Loyalty: The Philosophical Revolution against the Portuguese Monarchy</i>               |    |
| by Nicholas C. Hosford, University of Alabama at Birmingham .....                                      | 92 |

### **RELIGIOUS AND POLITICAL ENTANGLEMENTS**

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| <i>“Heretics they did us call”: The Implications of Nascent Scottish Protestant Discourse</i>                     |     |
| by Ashley Vee Foster, University of Alabama at Birmingham .....   | 114 |
| <i>“A Bountiful Harvest for the Granary of the Lord”: Southern Baptist Eschatology and its Mode of Production</i> |     |
| by Kris Steele, University of Central Florida .....   | 132 |

### **CULTURAL IDENTITIES ALONG THE PERIPHERY**

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| <i>A Cult of Fusion</i>  |     |
| by Dana Dawson, University of Alabama at Birmingham .....  | 142 |
| <i>The Persians as “Other”: Orientalism in the Ancient Period</i>                                      |     |
| by James Tingle, University of Alabama at Birmingham .....   | 151 |
| <i>Beyond the Census: Colonial Ethnography on India’s North-West Frontier</i>                          |     |
| by Zak Leonard, University of Chicago .....  | 158 |
| <i>Sojourns into the Past: The Methodological Benefits of Tourism in the Study of Cultural History</i> |     |
| by Justin Ciucevich, University of Alabama at Birmingham .....   | 173 |

## **BOOK REVIEWS**

*The Fiery Trial: Abraham Lincoln and American Slavery by Eric Foner.*

Reviewed by Richard Rowan, University of Alabama at Birmingham ..... 180

*Gettysburg: The Last Invasion by Allen C. Guelzo.*

Reviewed by Jay Jared Smith, University of Alabama at Birmingham..... 182

## **FILM REVIEWS**

### **A SYMPOSIUM ON 300: RISE OF AN EMPIRE**

*Hollywood vs. Herodotus: The Historical Failings of the film 300: Rise of an Empire*

Reviewed by Nicholas Bates, University of Alabama at Birmingham..... 186

*Themistocles or Leonidas?*

Reviewed by Chris Perry, University of Alabama at Birmingham..... 191

**ABOUT THE AUTHORS AND EDITORS** .....196



## LETTER FROM THE EDITORS

THE AMERICAN Civil War and its legacy have disturbed and fascinated not only the American mind, but also the minds of many of those beyond her own borders. Almost as soon as the first shots were fired at Fort Sumter in April 1861, laymen, politicians, and scholars alike began to study the conflict's causes and consequences. Many contemporary college survey courses still divide American history into two parts: the years which came before the Civil War and the years which came after it. And yet, despite the stark transformations wrought by the war, continuity existed between antebellum and postbellum America. We can draw a line, however crooked, connecting the American Revolution to the Civil War and to the long Civil Rights Movement. Emancipation—freedom alone for African Americans—could not solve the institutionalized ills of racial injustice. The duration of Jim Crow laws throughout the nation during much of the twentieth century stands as a testament to America's long struggle with the concepts of liberty and freedom. We still endeavor to answer crucial questions raised by the war: Who is a human being and what do particular characterizations of that concept entail? What do freedom and equality denote in reality? What, exactly, does it mean to live in a just society? How does one assess such abstract and historically polemical ideas?

For many people, studying the American Civil War has opened the door to debate and dialogue about these transcendent human questions. The essays collected here demonstrate that debates over freedom and equality are not new nor are they peculiarly American. For instance, we see ordinary people in eighteenth-century England asking about the nature of individual rights, at times even organizing and rioting in order to secure their definitions of liberty. We uncover Portuguese democratization in the twentieth century, as subjects became citizens by demanding freedom and power in a bloodless revolution. These ideas are apparent even during antiquity as freedom and oppression became rhetorical devices in the wars between ancient Greece and Persia. These articles thereby collectively illustrate not only the malleability of such concepts throughout the centuries, but also their permanence as discourse for contemporary means. What constituted liberty for one group could be perceived as oppression for another. Historical context, then, becomes key to appreciating and understanding these questions.

Our cover photo was chosen not with a particular bias toward the American Civil War but with the aim to inspire and provoke thoughtfulness, analysis, exploration, and conversation. Many Civil War soldiers witnessed the unprecedented scale of death, and meditated on the larger meaning of the conflict and their place within it. Perspectives changed for those on the battlefield at Antietam in 1862 as well as for those on Capitol Hill; founding American principles were questioned and then overturned as evolving definitions of liberty, freedom, and equality challenged individuals to transform orthodox societal structures and norms. By engaging in these universal debates about the nature of liberty and freedom and personhood, we are participating in a conversation that transcends space and time, that bridges the past with the present and also with the future.

In his presidential address to the American Historical Association, Charles Beard described written history as an act of faith. He suggested that historians have a responsibility to face their choices boldly, to be aware of the intellectual and moral perils inherent in their attempts to impose order on the chaos of the past.<sup>1</sup> We choose which past to study, and

---

<sup>1</sup> See Charles Beard, "Written History as an Act of Faith," *The American Historical Review* 39, no. 2 (January 1934): 219-231.

which history to write; we make these choices fearlessly, constantly subjecting ourselves to careful scrutiny in order to carve meaning from our existence.

We would like to end by expressing gratitude to those who made the publication of *The Vulcan Historical Review* possible. The entire UAB Department of History faculty and staff provided us with steadfast support and encouragement. Special thanks must be offered to Dr. Walter Ward, our faculty advisor; Dr. Carolyn Conley; Dr. Colin Davis; Dr. Harriet Amos Doss; Dr. Andrew Keitt; and Pamela Sterne King, all of whom continually challenge their students to consider new ideas and inspire within them a passion for history. Moreover, this publication of the *VHR* would not have been possible without the sustained support of Dr. Jean Ann Linney. Special thanks must also be extended to Dr. Eric Foner and Dr. Brian Steele, both of whom graciously allowed us to eavesdrop on their conversation and publish a portion of the results. Finally, we would like to thank our contributors, who have shared in this journey of historical inquiry. It is through such continuous, scrutinous scholarship that we hope to understand ourselves and our world.

Thank you for previewing the 2014 edition of *The Vulcan Historical Review*. To purchase the full edition, please contact:

Dr. Walter Ward  
History Department HHB 360D  
University of Alabama at Birmingham  
1401 University Boulevard  
Birmingham, Alabama 35294  
(205) 934-8699  
[ward@uab.edu](mailto:wward@uab.edu)